

PAUL'S TRANSFORMATION LEADERSHIP BEHAVIOR IN THE LETTER TO TITUS

Budi Harwanto

Faculty of Philosophy, Klabat University, Indonesia
bharwanto@unklab.ac.id

Abstract

Leadership is an essential tool to fulfill the objectives of church ministry and mission. Among several leadership styles, transformation leadership behavior is one of effective model to be implemented in the church. Since most of the transformational leadership discussion has focused secular organization context, it needs to construct a biblical foundation and its implication for the church organization setting. This study applies both theoretical review and biblical analysis that based on the Paul's letter to Titus. The review of literature shows that theories on transformational leadership supports the characteristics of Paul's leadership style. Paul develops a personal connection with Titus and this presents transformational leadership principles. Paul displays individual consideration by considering Titus as his true son in faith and as a vital co-worker instead of a general follower. Although Titus has some weaknesses as a young leader, the influence of his mentor encourages him to do his leadership tasks. Moreover, Paul inspired Titus to be a faithful minister of God. He motivated him with a clear vision of the ministry by providing a good church leadership to face challenges. The blessed hope of eternal life became a great encouragement for Titus in dealing with critical situations. Finally, Paul stimulated Titus to teach the Cretan congregation true sound doctrine. Through intellectual stimulation, Titus is encouraged to study the word of God carefully and apply it. Consequently, by applying the model of Paul's leadership, Titus was being productive leader to the Cretan community of faith. Thus, an application in church arena helps the church progressively conform to Christ's image. Church leaders' behavior motivates church members to consistently grow in church community.

Keywords: *Paul, transformational leadership, Titus.*

Introduction

Church leadership plays a significant role in church ministry and mission. Leadership style in church setting is an important issue to be considered because it influences members to become committed to the church. Leadership theories have been developed in various ways through the years. One of this leadership theory is transformational leadership. Transformational leadership was introduced by James MacGregor Burns. He emphasized it in raising the devotee's familiarity with the significance of organizational results, helping adherents go further from the self, and supporting in moving the adherent's necessities to a more elevated level.¹

¹ James M. Burns, *Leadership*, (New York, NY: Harper & Row), 1978, 172.

Transformation leadership has a significant contribution to church growth when it is applied in the church organization. Since a transformational leader is used by God as His agency to turn non disciples into Christ's disciples, he/she should have a consistent impact to other people. According to Malphurs and Mancini, transformational leadership can transform people into fully-functioning disciples.² If the church has functioning disciples, it only means that it has active members who can be retained. Indeed, transformational leadership is a means toward an active membership,³ strong membership retention,⁴ and positive organizational outcomes.⁵ However, a question needs to be answered is what a biblical model and its implication of the transformational leadership behavior. Thus, a transformational leader motivates to lead and focuses on organizational objectives by developing followers into future leaders.

Theoretical Review of Transformational Leadership

Leadership Defined

It is hard to draw an exact definition of leadership. Scholars have developed leadership definitions in many different ways according to the given contexts. In the church organizational setting, leadership is different from secular organization, political setting, or business areas. Although it shares some similar theories, it is still important to note that the application of the foundational biblical values, mission goals, and spiritual power creates a distinct worldview of Christian leadership that influences its approach and practice.⁶

Theologically speaking, leadership in Christian community is a calling. It is a calling of God to His people to actualize Christ's life and engage in God's mission in the world. God provides spiritual gifts as one of leadership equipment to effectively do the task of leadership. Christian leaders are responsible to exercise the gifts to lead people in accomplishing God's goal. Moreover, leading and accomplishing the mission require a vision and motivation of leaders. According to McConnell, leadership deals with a "process in which leaders influence followers

² Aubrey Malphurs & Will Mancini, *Building Leaders: Blueprints for Developing Leadership at Every Level of Your Church*. (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker), 2004.

³Anthony Wayne Adams, *Shepherd leadership of Church of God pastors and how this relates to ministerial effectiveness* (Doctoral dissertation). Available from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (UMI No. 3570373), 2013.

⁴Budi Harwanto, *The mediating role of disciple-making process in the relationship of transformational leadership behavior, church ministry programs, and church membership retention* (Doctoral dissertations). Adventist International Institute of Advanced Studies, Silang Cavite, Philippines, 2016, 212.

⁵ Noelle F. Scuderi, *Servant leadership and transformational leadership in church organizations* (Doctoral dissertation). Available from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (UMI No. 3413541), 2010.

⁶Edgar J. Elliston, Leadership theory. In A. S. Moreau, H. Netland, & C. van Engen (Eds.), *Evangelical dictionary of world missions* (pp. 567-568). (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2000), 567.

in given contexts to achieve the purposes to which they were called.”⁷ In other words, Christian leadership is God’s calling to every believer to share the vision and motivation in order to influence people in fulfilling His mission under the guidance of the Holy Spirit and through spiritual gifts.

The method of Christian leadership is an assignment of leaders to influence groups of people in a particular context and period in an agenda of transformation. The focused task deals with “transforming society through the power of God’s gracious love.”⁸ Whether it takes in a short or long period, the effectiveness of leadership involves individuals or groups of people that are influenced and empowered enough by the transforming purposes of the leadership agenda. The application of this issue is by “moving people on to God’s agenda.”⁹ Several factors contribute to the effectiveness of Christian leadership. It deals with God’s calling, exercising of spiritual gifts, culture and context, and the agenda of leadership mission. To have a broader view of leadership, related leadership theories should be considered.

Transformational leadership behavior. The development of transformational leadership is influenced by contemporary political leadership wherein leadership is considered from the perspective of leaders and followers. Leadership is not only about doing the task by using the power; it also deals with the accomplishment of leaders to fulfill the followers’ needs. James Burns differentiates transformational and transactional leadership style. Transactional leadership deals with the exchanges that appear between the leaders and followers. It may exchange for the benefits of both parties to fulfill the intended goals.¹⁰ In contrast, transformational leadership focuses on the person’s engagement process that creates relationship in contributing to the higher degree of morality and motivation of both leaders and followers.¹¹ The purpose between the two models is to motivate the followers. However, transactional leadership promotes the exchange of reward for the preferred outcomes while transformational leadership encourages followers to have a collective commitment toward the organizational goals. Consequently, transformational leadership approach impacts the intrinsic motivation that remains longer in the followers as compared to transactional leadership.¹²

Bernard M. Bass modifies the prior transformational leadership theory by proposing leadership as a motivation. In particular, transformational leadership aims to motivate the followers, make them aware of the importance of the organizational goals, transform their self-interest to organizational orientation purpose, and promote subordinates to a higher degree of

⁷ Douglas McConnel, Leadership. In A. S. Moreau, H. Netland, & C. van Engen (Eds.), *Evangelical dictionary of world missions* (pp. 565-567). (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2000), 565.

⁸Kevin Treston, *Creative Christian leadership: Skill for more effective ministry*, (Mystic, CT: Twenty-Third), 1995, 10.

⁹ Henry T. Blackaby & Richard Blackaby, *Spiritual leadership: Moving people on to God’s agenda*, (Nashville, TN: B&H, 2001), 10.

¹⁰ James M. Burns, 175.

¹¹ Peter G. Northouse, *Leadership: Theory and practice* (5th ed.). (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 2021), 189.

¹² Arwiphawee Srithongrung, The causal relationships among transformational leadership, organizational commitment, and employee effectiveness. *International Journal of Public Administration*, 34(6), 376-388. doi:10.1080/01900692.2011.569917, 2011, 376.

expectations and needs.¹³ In addition, transformational leadership aims to improve the followers' accomplishment and development to reach the optimal capability.

Moreover, transformational leadership attempts to change and conduct the transformation process of standard values, emotions, and expectations of the followers. The leaders' strong values and communication transform their followers. Consequently, the moral value and motivation of leaders and followers increase. In summary, transformational leadership "inspires followers to trust the leader, perform behaviors that contribute to the achievement of organizational goals, and perform at high levels."¹⁴

This study identifies the development of four dimensions of transformation leadership behavior. These factors involve *idealized influence*, *intellectual stimulation*, *individual consideration*, and *inspirational motivation*. The descriptions of each element are discussed in the following.

Idealized influence. This element refers to the acts of the leaders who serve as role models to the followers. The leaders share an example on ethical and moral basis. The followers identify and imitate the leaders' behavior to implement an appropriate action. This promotes the leaders' charisma to influence the followers by setting an example and becoming a role model to them. Leaders who have idealized influence can prepare a clear "vision and a sense of mission, and it instills pride along with follower respect and trust."¹⁵

Intellectual stimulation. This element can be observed in the leaders' behavior when they stimulate their followers to be more creative and innovative by asking their opinions and letting them voice their new ideas that can help attain organizational goals. Thus, leaders communicate well with the followers to stimulate their ideas for particular issues. They encourage the followers to think creatively and involve them to solve challenges. In addition, leaders promote the intelligence of the followers. Consequently, the followers become creative, innovative, and problem-solving individuals who can devise new solutions.¹⁶

Individual consideration. This element relates to leaders who extend personal support and meet the needs and concerns of the followers for their achievement and growth. Leaders act as mentors or coaches to help the followers develop more. They know how to treat the members individually. They consider the different needs of the followers especially their needs to accomplish the achievement. Individual consideration behavior promotes the emergence of

¹³ Bernard M. Bass, *Leadership and performance beyond expectations*. (New York, NY: Free, 1985), 96.

¹⁴ Jennifer George and Gareth Jones, *Understanding and managing organizational behavior* (6th ed.). (Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Prentice Hall, 2012), 536.

¹⁵John R. Schermerhorn Jr, James G. Hunt, Richard N. Osborn, & Mary Uhl-Bien, *Organizational behavior* (11th ed.). (Hoboken, NJ: Wiley, 2010), 324.

¹⁶ Nazim Çoğaltay, Conceptual perspectives on leadership. In E. Karadäg (Ed.), *Leadership and organizational outcomes: Meta-analysis of empirical studies* (pp. 1-18). doi:10.1007/978-3-319-14908-0_1, 2015, 17.

supportive environment within an organization.¹⁷This dimension also promotes leaders to understand the leadership style that is effective and matched to the individual organizational members.

Inspirational motivation. This element refers to the leaders' behavior that inspires and motivates the followers by providing meanings and challenges. Leaders encourage the followers to envision the future state for their development. They inspire organizational members to identify and recognize their organizational task. They establish motivation to challenge them to optimize work performance. They provide encouragement to remind them of their values to the organization. In addition, they create enthusiasm, optimism, and avoid the climate of competitiveness.¹⁸ Inspirational motivation in local church organizational setting is the motivation of leaders to church members. Church leaders inspire the members by providing a valuable meaning of church membership and its role in the church mission and ministry. Although there are some challenges, church leaders can encourage the members to overcome the challenges and fulfill the defined goals.

Biblical Concept of Transformational Leadership Behavior

The Bible illustrates different kinds of leadership which has started from God and has been shared to His trusted and faithful followers. This section discusses, in particular, the transformational leadership that is portrayed by God, Jesus, the Twelve, and the next generation of Christ's disciples. In addition, the transformational leadership exemplified by Paul and Titus is considered.

Biblical concept of transformation

God is the first leader in the Bible. He is the initiator of transformational leadership. The account of creation confirms that God is the Leader who creates the world. God's transformational power enables Him to create complete and perfect creation from the formless and empty earth (Gen 1:2, 31). In addition, creation is not simply an instant accident because God has purposes and visions for His creation. One of the purposes is that God begins the leadership and empowers the first human beings to share leadership patterns to rule over the world (Gen 1:28). God provides a vision, model, and leadership empowerment. He intends "the first act of leadership, to be followed as a model for human leadership."¹⁹

Jesus's ministry continuously reflects God's transformational leadership. His leadership is to change the existing influence of social, cultural, and environmental worldly characteristics

¹⁷Ibid, 14.

¹⁸ Arwiphawee Srithongrung, 370.

¹⁹ Jacques B. Doukhan, The creation narrative. In S. Bell (Ed.), *Servants & friends: Biblical theology of leadership* (pp. 31-47). (Berrien Springs, MI: Andrews University, 2014), 43.

into God's characteristics. The recruitment of the Twelve shows the vision of Jesus on transformational leadership. He begins to train the Twelve to be the agents of change. Jesus calls the disciples while they are in their own work. For instance, Peter is called while he is a fisherman. However, Jesus wants to transform him to be a fisher of man (Mark 1:16). The election of Peter to be a future spiritual leader indicates Jesus's transformational intention in his life. Doug Tilstra considers this issue by saying that "Peter did not have that spiritual quality until he had been transformed by Christ. Thus, Peter's life demonstrates transformation that leads to healthy community and Christ-like leadership."²⁰

Paul's and Titus's model of transformational leadership

Paul addresses a letter to Titus as his youth co-worker to discuss some pastoral and congregational issues. This epistle is categorized as a pastoral letter although it is not fully appropriate because the content of the Epistle does not talk completely about pastoral job. However, it is directed to a person who has a pastoral role and ministry. It is like a letter from the official leaders to the subordinate co-workers who are in charge of leadership in a certain territory.²¹ Furthermore, Paul is concerned about church ministry and its leadership at Crete through the leadership of Titus. He focuses on the spiritual life of the congregation as well as the role of the leaders to deal with their characteristics or qualities and contributions to the church. In addition, the characteristics of Paul's transformational leadership style can be examined through his letter to Titus.

Paul's leadership authority. Paul affirms that his leadership authority is from God who has entrusted him to proclaim the Gospel. His leadership is not his personal purposes but he executes God's agenda to spread the reign of God in various territories. He begins his letter with a description of himself and God. He introduces himself as "a servant of God and an apostle of Jesus Christ" (Titus 1:1, NIV). Paul identifies himself both as a servant and an apostle. The salutation indicates that a servant refers to the ownership by other parties in which slavery requires total obedience to the Master. On the other hand, the apostle indicates that a person holds "an authoritative messenger from Christ."²² This personal identification implies that Paul is a property that fully belongs to God who has been granted the apostolic task. According to Walter L. Liefeld, "If slavery meant obligation, apostleship meant authority, but both meant responsibility."²³

Paul attempts to say that his leadership applies the divine power to transform congregational life. He explains that the privilege of being a servant and an apostle of God

²⁰Doug Tilstra, Peter: A narrative of transformation. In S. Bell (Ed.), *Servants & friends: Biblical theology of leadership* (pp. 291-307). (Berrien Springs, MI: Andrews University, 2014), 291.

²¹ Ben Whiterington III, *Letters and homilies for Hellenized Christian: A socio-rhetorical commentary on Titus, 1-2 Timothy, and 1-3 John* (Vol. 1). (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2006), 96.

²²William D. Mounce, Pastoral Epistles. In R. P. Martin (Ed.), *Word Biblical Commentary* (Vol. 46, pp. 1-786). (Nashville, TN: Thomas Nelson, 2000), 378.

²³ Walter L. Liefeld, *1 & 2 Timothy/Titus: The NIV Application Commentary*. (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 1999), 309.

requires a responsibility “to further the faith of God’s elect and their knowledge of the truth that leads to godliness” (Titus 1:1, NIV). The perspective of Paul’s leadership role seems to suggest that the purpose of his servanthood and apostolic ministry is to enhance the growth and transformation of God’s elected people under the method of the knowledge of truth.

Whiterington points out that Paul does not prefer the philosophical human knowledge; however, he suggests valid knowledge that can transform His people to godliness.²⁴ Thus, the apostle Paul declares that the work of his ministry is under the direction of God as the Commander.

Paul’s leadership standard. Paul emphasizes the importance of the standard of leadership qualities. He suggests Titus to elect elders who are *blameless* to be ready to transform the congregation with true knowledge and correct the opponents in the midst of crisis in the churches at Crete. First, Paul points out that the characteristics or qualities of church leaders must fulfill the standard of ethics and moral of the practical life (Titus 1:6-8). It suggests that church leadership should exemplify proper life on a daily basis, thereby showing exemplary behavior to the family. Thus, children can be real witnesses of their father’s leadership quality.

Second, Paul urges Titus on the qualification of a leader on the standard of the devotion to Scripture teaching. A leader must “hold firmly to the trustworthy message” (Titus 1:9, NIV). Paul upholds that the sound doctrine of God is the standard for leadership and congregational life (Titus 1:9; 2:1). The basis of the message is focused on the content of the teaching. It refers to the Gospel as the authoritative set of doctrines recommended by the apostle. This exposition signifies the role of church leaders to stand on the Scripture as the standard of leadership. Thus, Lea and Griffin summarize that church leadership standard must “regard their home life, their personality and character traits, and their doctrinal integrity.”²⁵

Paul and Titus’s relationship. The Epistle describes that Titus is more likely to have struggles in dealing with the surrounding communities of the Cretan congregation. There are some false teachers that oppose the church. The letter provides the description of the teaching regarding “the circumcision group” (Titus 1:10, NIV), “Jewish myths” (Titus 1:14, NIV), controversy about genealogies, and “quarrels about the law” (Titus 3:9, NIV). Titus needs some counsels and motivations from his mentor. Some of Paul’s words of encouragement that show his transformational leadership style are discussed in the following subsections.

Titus as a son and co-worker. Paul calls the recipient of his letter with an expression “my true son in our common faith” (Titus 1:4, NIV). This statement indicates a close and intimate relationship between Paul and Titus. The phrase *genuine son* implies that Titus is Paul’s convert.²⁶ Although Titus is an uncircumcised Gentile (Gal 2:3), Paul declares the parentage by the mutual share of faith. This intimate relationship denotes the assurance of Paul’s expectation for Titus to be his right representative in the ministry.

²⁴ Ben Whiterington III, 114.

²⁵ Thomas D. Lea & Hayne P. Griffin, *1, 2 Timothy, Titus: The New American commentary*. (Nashville, TN: Broadman, 1992), 287.

²⁶ Ben Whiterington III, 117.

Several accounts of the Pauline Corpus show that Paul treats Titus as co-worker even though he is Paul's successor and subordinate. Paul humbles himself in equality as with Christ's workers. He portrays his anxiety and distress because of the absence of his coworker that he cannot hear any news from Titus about the situations of the Corinthians. However, Paul is seen rejoicing when he hears that people present their defense to him (2 Cor 2:13; 7:6-7). Moreover, Paul recognizes Titus as his partner and coworker among believers by commending him for his obedience and ministry (2 Cor 8:18-19). Accordingly, Paul writes Titus's name as the recipient of his letter to reward him for his good reputation in ministry and encourage him because of the critical situation in Crete.

Empowerment. Very few evidences can provide the background of Titus. While in his travel, Paul mentions to Barnabas the name of Titus as his companion (Gal 2:1). It is an important travel as part of Paul's journey to visit Jerusalem for the second time. He speaks about the role of Titus in the ministry in 2 Corinthians and in his letter to Titus. Through these two Epistles, Paul expresses the delegation of some crucial ministries to Titus. For instance, Titus acts as a mediator in Paul's crisis in dealing with the Gentile converts (Gal 2:1) and the disputes with the Corinthians (2 Cor 7). In addition, Paul sends Titus to collect the offerings in Jerusalem to help the famine (2 Cor 8:16-19). Finally, Paul instructs Titus to lead the elders' election and be responsible to manage the crisis in the Cretan churches (Titus 1-3). This ministry of delegation became an empowerment method of Paul's leadership. He took Titus as his travel companion to observe his ministry. He gave mentorship and instruction on how to do the task. Then, he gave him the authority to lead and distribute responsibilities in a particular field.

Skip Bell points out that leadership empowerment means trusting, assigning work, sharing responsibilities, releasing control, and providing resources for other people to be involved in the work of ministry.²⁷ Furthermore, Covey suggests that empowerment is "the natural result of both personal and organizational trustworthiness, which enables people to identify and unleash their human potential"²⁸ Paul applies the empowerment approach to develop Titus's leadership abilities and capabilities.

Modeling. Paul's life and ministry is a model for believers that includes Titus, his son in common faith. The epistle to Titus expresses Paul's repentance. In addition, the lives of Paul and Titus are presented as a model of Christian life. At one time, they experience living in darkness but by the grace of the Lord, they are justified and renewed by the Holy Spirit. Thus, they have a blessed hope of salvation and eagerly live and do good things (Titus 3:3-14). It is an experience of repentance and spiritual growth that enable Christian leaders to be a role model to other believers.

Furthermore, both the life and ministry of Paul and Titus serve as an example to Christianity in Corinth and Crete. Paul reveals that Titus's integrity and credibility in his ministry become the living minister's example to the church (2 Cor 12:18). In addition, Paul

²⁷ Skip Bell, *A time to serve: Church leadership for the 21st century*. (Lincoln, NE: Advent Source, 2003), 102.

²⁸ Stephen R. Covey, *The 8th habit: From effectiveness to greatness*. (New York, NY: Free, 2004), 253.

instructs Titus to elect the elders who hold a high standard of life both in their home and in their community (Titus 1:6-8). It suggests that integrity and credibility are significant values in leadership modeling. According to Kouzes and Posner, “Credibility is the foundation of leadership. If people don’t believe in the messenger, they won’t believe the message.”²⁹ This characteristic of the ministry model encourages Titus to be faithful in ministry. The experience of Titus’s leadership and ministry proves that the youth minister is “one of Paul’s most faithful and constant workers.”³⁰

Visioneering. Leadership is about influencing to produce change and organizational movement. To lead a change, leadership needs to establish a direction setting for the future plan.³¹ Paul encourages Titus to administer solutions to the problem in the midst of the Cretan churches crisis. Paul describes the felt needs of church leadership. The primary purpose is to have an established healthy church leadership. He sets a clear planning on election and deals with other teaching challenges. He explains the grounded leadership requirement. He also implements a managerial planning for Titus’s leadership role and provides a strategic direction to do the task.

Motivation. Conflict management and leading change were critical issues of Titus’s ministry. Paul motivated Titus to hold firmly on the healthy Scripture teachings. Titus should have had a commitment of action toward his leadership task. Furthermore, Paul reminded Titus to fulfill the duty of teaching with all authority (Titus 2:15). Paul confirmed his apostolic authority to instruct Titus’s ministry earlier in the Epistle. Titus was encouraged with authorized motivation in relationship to Paul. Although there would be people who despised him, Paul instructed him to focus on teaching the sound doctrine. Paul’s motivation to him was also critical because he wanted him to be productive in his leadership.

Application of Paul’s and Titus’s Model of Transformational Leadership Behavior

The review of literature shows that Bass’s theory on transformational leadership supports the characteristics of Paul’s leadership style. Paul develops a personal connection with Titus and this presents transformational leadership principles. By considering Titus as his true son in faith and as a vital co-worker instead of a general follower, Paul displays individual consideration. Paul prepares Titus by mentoring and training him for practical ministry. Furthermore, Paul’s life and leadership fulfill the needs of Titus to be a role model of the leadership successor. Although Titus has some weaknesses as a young leader, the influence of his mentor encourages him to do his leadership tasks.

Moreover, Paul inspired Titus to be a faithful minister of God. He motivated him with a clear vision of the ministry by providing a good church leadership to face challenges. The

²⁹ James M. Kouzes & Barry Z. Posner, *Leadership is a relationship*. In J. M. Kouzes & B. Z. Posner (Eds.), *Christian reflections on the leadership challenge* (pp. 119-126). (San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 2004), 120.

³⁰ Ben Whiterington III, 88.

³¹ Robert J. Banks & Bernice M. Ledbetter, *Reviewing leadership: A Christian evaluation of current approaches*. (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2016), 112

blessed hope of eternal life became a great encouragement for Titus in dealing with critical situations. Finally, Paul stimulated Titus to teach the Cretan congregation true sound doctrine. Through intellectual stimulation, Titus is encouraged to study the word of God carefully and apply it. The empowerment to prepare strategies of conflict management both in Crete and Corinth promotes Titus's ministerial experience. Table below portrays Paul's transformational leadership behavior in relation to Titus's ministry.

Leadership is an important element of both secular and religious organizational growth. Leadership as one of the most crucial factors of church health and growth. Furthermore, church leadership also holds an important role to revitalize the plateaued and declined church. Leadership performance can effectively enhance growth and promote believers' retention.³² Leaders' influence contributes to achievement of goals, vision direction, and church growth. Thus, church leadership is significant within the body of church organizational setting.

Principles of Paul's Transformational Leadership Behavior in Relation to Titus's Ministry

Dimensions	Characteristics
Idealized influence	Paul served as a role model to Titus. He recruited, trained, mentored, prepared, and involved him for ministry.
Intellectual stimulation	Paul stimulated Titus to stand firm on Bible doctrine, carefully study the Bible, and teach the congregation with healthy teachings. He put Titus in congregational crisis to find proper conflict solutions.
Individual consideration	Paul presented a personal relationship concern for Titus in a critical situation. He provided personal guidance to pass through the trials in the ministry.
Inspirational motivation	Paul inspired Titus with a clear vision of ministry, his apostolic authorization, and the blessed hope of eternal life.

The foundational purpose of transformational leadership is to discover the degree of motivation and the moral level of both leaders and subordinates³³. It supports the Christian perspective of ministry to transform human purpose to God's agenda. Stowell suggests that transformational leadership behavior application in church arena helps the church progressively conform to Christ's image.³⁴ Church leaders' behavior motivates church members to consistently

³² Budi Harwanto, 223.

³³ Robert J. Banks & Bernice M. Ledbetter, 114.

³⁴ Joseph M. Stowell, *Shepherding the church: Effective spiritual leadership in a changing culture*. (Chicago, IL: Moody Press, 1997), 157.

grow in church community. Exemplary lifestyle of the leaders is a valuable contribution to establish a healthy attitude among the congregation. Moreover, Barbuto and Wheeler suggest that the goal of the organization can be achieved if a transformational leaders motivate their followers by focusing on the objectives of the organization and developing prospective leaders.³⁵ If church leadership can influence the church body, Transformational leadership may highly promote the effectiveness of church ministry and mission.

³⁵John E. Barbuto Jr., & Daniel W. Wheeler, Scale development and construct clarification of servant leadership. *Group & Organization Management*, 31(3), 300-326. doi:10.1177/1059601106287091, 2006, 302.

Bibliography

- Adams, Anthony Wayne. *Shepherd leadership of Church of God pastors and how this relates to ministerial effectiveness* (Doctoral dissertation). Available from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (UMI No. 3570373), 2013.
- Banks, Robert J. & Ledbetter, Bernice M. *Reviewing leadership: A Christian evaluation of current approaches*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2016.
- Barbuto, John E. Jr., & Wheeler, Daniel W. Scale development and construct clarification of servant leadership. *Group & Organization Management*, 31(3), 300-326. doi:10.1177/1059601106287091, 2006, 302.
- Bass, Bernard M. *Leadership and performance beyond expectations*. New York, NY: Free, 1985.
- Bell, Skip. *A time to serve: Church leadership for the 21st century*. Lincoln, NE: Advent Source, 2003.
- Blackaby, Henry T. & Blackaby, Richard. *Spiritual leadership: Moving people on to God's agenda*, Nashville, TN: B&H, 2001.
- Burns, James M. *Leadership*. New York, NY: Harper & Row, 1978.
- Çoğaltay, Nazim. Conceptual perspectives on leadership. In E. Karadäg (Ed.), *Leadership and organizational outcomes: Meta-analysis of empirical studies* (pp. 1-18). doi:10.1007/978-3-319-14908-0_1, 2015.
- Covey, Stephen R. *The 8th habit: From effectiveness to greatness*. New York, NY: Free, 2004.
- Doukhan, Jacques B. The creation narrative. In S. Bell (Ed.), *Servants & friends: Biblical theology of leadership* (pp. 31-47). Berrien Springs, MI: Andrews University, 2014.
- Elliston, Edgar J. Leadership theory. In A. S. Moreau, H. Netland, & C. van Engen (Eds.), *Evangelical dictionary of world missions* (pp. 567-568). Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2000.
- George, Jennifer and Jones, Gareth. *Understanding and managing organizational behavior* (6th ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Prentice Hall, 2012.
- Harwanto, Budi. *The mediating role of disciple-making process in the relationship of transformational leadership behavior, church ministry programs, and church membership retention* (Doctoral dissertations). Adventist International Institute of Advanced Studies, Silang Cavite, Philippines, 2016.

- Kouzes, James M. & Posner, Barry Z. Leadership is a relationship. In J. M. Kouzes & B. Z. Posner (Eds.), *Christian reflections on the leadership challenge* (pp. 119-126). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 2004.
- Lea, Thomas D. & Griffin, Hayne P. *1, 2 Timothy, Titus: The New American commentary*. Nashville, TN: Broadman, 1992.
- Liefeld, Walter L. *1 & 2 Timothy/Titus: The NIV Application Commentary*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 1999.
- Malphurs, Aubrey & Mancini, Will. *Building Leaders: Blueprints for Developing Leadership at Every Level of Your Church*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2004.
- McConnel, Douglas. Leadership. In A. S. Moreau, H. Netland, & C. van Engen (Eds.), *Evangelical dictionary of world missions* (pp. 565-567). Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2000.
- Mounce, William D. Pastoral Epistles. In R. P. Martin (Ed.), *Word Biblical Commentary* (Vol. 46, pp. 1-786). Nashville, TN: Thomas Nelson, 2000.
- Northouse, Peter G. *Leadership: Theory and practice* (5th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 2021.
- Schermerhorn Jr, John R., Hunt, James G., Osborn, Richard N., & Uhl-Bien, Mary. *Organizational behavior* (11th ed.). Hoboken, NJ: Wiley, 2010.
- Scuderi, Noelle F. *Servant leadership and transformational leadership in church organizations* (Doctoral dissertation). Available from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (UMI No. 3413541), 2010.
- Srithongrung, Arwiphawee. The causal relationships among transformational leadership, organizational commitment, and employee effectiveness. *International Journal of Public Administration*, 34(6), 376-388. doi:10.1080/01900692.2011.569917, 2011.
- Stowell, Joseph M. *Shepherding the church: Effective spiritual leadership in a changing culture*. (Chicago, IL: Moody Press, 1997.
- Tilstra, Doug, Peter: A narrative of transformation. In S. Bell (Ed.), *Servants & friends: Biblical theology of leadership* (pp. 291-307). Berrien Springs, MI: Andrews University, 2014.
- Treston, Kevin. *Creative Christian leadership: Skill for more effective ministry*, Mystic, CT: Twenty-Third, 1995.
- Whiterington III, Ben. *Letters and homilies for Hellenized Christian: A socio-rhetorical commentary on Titus, 1-2 Timothy, and 1-3 John* (Vol. 1). Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2006.